Update: An efficient, objective index for predictive disease incidence ranking of COVID-19 vaccine trial sites

Authors: Bradley G. Wagner^{1*,} Prashanth Selvaraj¹ and Stewart T. Chang¹

January 22nd, 2021

- 1. Institute for Disease Modeling, Global Health, Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation
- * Contact author: bwagner@idmod.org

Purpose of document:

The aim of this report is to provide ongoing updates to predictive subnational results for selection of vaccine-trial sites based on future COVID-19 disease incidence. The output of the analysis is a normalized, ranking index between 0 and 1 we denote as "G". This value predicts trial sites in terms of confidence in COVID-19 case incidence beginning after a two-month lag from the selection date (corresponding roughly to site prep time). This report provides updated results for the November 13th and December 16th documents of the same name. For discussion regarding interpretation of results as well as methodology and validation of methods please refer to the <u>original document</u>. A short additional discussion of the implications for model predictions of emergence and circulation of novel SARS-CoV-2 variants is included in the final section as well as a short discussion of some country level changes in estimates from previous reports.

Document structure and usage:

Countries for which results have been updated are indicated in Table 1 including the geographic level of analysis. The time period of data used in the analysis as well as the corresponding future trial start dates for which the analysis is relevant are denoted in Table 2. Tables and figures sections correspond to those in the original document. As described in the original document, the modeling methodology does not account for future introduction of novel interventions that may reduce transmission. As such these methods should only be used to evaluate future vaccine trial sites in regions where there **is not yet**

population-wide vaccine coverage. Note that predictive index values will change with temporal updates and such changes may be related to epidemiology and immunity, behavior, public policy, or other factors. The method is based on case data (it makes no assumptions regarding case detection rate), but it is not mechanistic, and as such makes no claims as to the underlying drivers of prediction changes.

As described in more detail in the <u>original document</u> the method described computes a normalized index (**G-index**, ranging from 0 to 1) designed to rank prediction trial sites in terms of confidence in COVID-19 case incidence beginning after a two-month lag from the selection date (corresponding roughly to site prep time). Higher values indicate more confidence in sustained transmission; values greater than 0.5 indicate the epidemic is more likely than not to have been in a growth phase during the historical lookback period used to construct the index.

Emergence of novel SARS-CoV-2 variants

The predictive index presented does not explicitly consider emergence of (potentially more transmissible) novel variants of SARS-CoV-2. However, since the index is based on historical growth in cases such variants are implicitly accounted for in the computation. It should be noted that, as discussed in the <u>original</u> <u>document</u>, the index uses the past as a predictor of the future and therefore cannot predict either outbreaks where there is no history of circulation or the future emergence of more transmissible variants. The index takes into account the impact of novel variants only after there is a history of population-level circulation, and therefore one should be cautious in interpreting predictions in the lag phase between emergence of known higher transmissibility variants and their fixation in the population.

Qualitative changes at the country level

We note that at the country level, The Gambia has shown sustained transmission over a 2-month or longer time period (G= 0.59) for the first time dating back to July 2020 data. As discussed in the <u>original document</u> qualitative changes can be an artifact of changes in testing; however, in this case such observed increases would be less likely to be sustained over long time periods. In fact, the parsimonious definition of the index **G**—as the probability of the reproductive number to be above 1 over a 2-month time period —is motivated by the desire to be robust to rapid changes in testing which may appear as rapid increases and decreases in the effective reproduction number. For a regional, country-level comparison we included analysis for Mozambique and Malawi (see Figures section 2). Both countries show, to some degree, a similar pattern of qualitative change in effective sustained effective reproduction number above 1 (estimated from case data) with G=0.84, 0.68 respectively.

 Table 1: Countries and regions represented in the trial site analysis and geographic level of analysis.

 References indicate where the collated disease incidence data that underlies the model was obtained,

 if applicable.

Country	Geographic level of analysis
Argentina	subnational ²
Brazil	subnational ³
Colombia	subnational ³
Gambia	national ⁴
Malawi	national ⁴
Mozambique	national ⁴
India	subnational ³
Mexico	subnational ⁴
Pakistan	subnational ⁴
United Kingdom	subnational ³

Table 2: Index values by region:

G-index values computed by region. The lookback period used is indicated as well as target trial start date. Here the target trial start date is 2 months from the decision point (the last data collected) as was empirically validated (see Validation section and Definitions in the original document). Maps showing the geographic distribution of the index by country are given in section Figures: Spatial heterogeneity. Historical Rt estimates for each region are shown in section Figures: Historical Rt estimates. Note that lookback periods and target trial dates were chosen at the country level.

Country	Region	Index Value (G)	Lookback Period	Target Trial Start Date
Argentina	Misiones	0.937	20-11-15 – 21-1-	21-3-15
			15	
Argentina	Catamarca	0.759		
Argentina	City of Buenos Aires	0.758		
Argentina	Rio Negro	0.732		
Argentina	Province of Buenos Aires	0.724		
Argentina	Formosa	0.722		

Argentina	Entre Rios	0.700		
Argentina	Neuquen	0.683		
Argentina	Chubut	0.666		
Argentina	La Pampa	0.648		
Argentina	Jujuy	0.645		
Argentina	Santiago del Estero	0.509		
Argentina	Cordoba	0.493		
Argentina	Salta	0.488		
Argentina	Santa Fe	0.482		
Argentina	Chaco	0.456		
Argentina	Mendoza	0.449		
Argentina	Corrientes	0.441		
Argentina	La Rioja	0.412		
Argentina	Tucuman	0.376		
Argentina	Tierra del Fuego	0.281		
Argentina	San Luis	0.272		
Argentina	San Juan	0.124		
Brazil	Mato Grosso	0.969	20-11-15 –21-1-15	21-3-15
Brazil	Rondania	0.960		
Brazil	Sao Paulo	0.942		
Brazil	Amazonas	0.911		
Brazil	Minas Gerais	0.909		
Brazil	Paraba	0.862		
Brazil	Para	0.820		
Brazil	Rio de Janeiro	0.810		
Brazil	Alagoas	0.798		
Brazil	Tocantins	0.739		
Brazil	Distrito Federal	0.686		
Brazil	Sergipe	0.645		
Brazil	Parana	0.628		
Brazil	Pernambuco	0.628		
Brazil	Ceara	0.617		
Brazil	Goias	0.609		
Brazil	Bahia	0.592		
Brazil	Amapa	0.585		
Brazil	Rio Grande do Norte	0.578		
Brazil	Espirito Santo	0.549		
Brazil	Piaui	0.543		
Brazil	Rio Grande do Sul	0.535		
Brazil	Mato Grosso do Sul	0.509		
Brazil	Acre	0.488		
Brazil	Maranhao	0.472		
Brazil	Roraima	0.430		

Brazil	Santa Catarina	0.354		
Colombia	Cundinamarca	1.000	20-11-15 – 21-1-15	21-3-15
Colombia	Bogota	0.993		
Colombia	Narino	0.990		
Colombia	Santander	0.972		
Colombia	Putumayo	0.971		
Colombia	Valle del Cauca (incl Cali)	0.952		
Colombia	Tolima	0.950		
Colombia	Atlantico	0.941		
Colombia	Cauca	0.903		
Colombia	Choco	0.896		
Colombia	Magdalena	0.864		
Colombia	Antioquia	0.836		
Colombia	Meta	0.802		
Colombia	Sucre	0.779		
Colombia	Воуаса	0.776		
Colombia	Risaralda	0.761		
Colombia	Cesar	0.756		
Colombia	Huila	0.751		
Colombia	Casanare	0.728		
Colombia	Cordoba	0.708		
Colombia	Amazonas	0.647		
Colombia	Caldas	0.622		
Colombia	Bolivar	0.603		
Colombia	Quindio	0.585		
Colombia	Guaviare	0.579		
Colombia	Norte de Santander	0.563		
Colombia	Arauca	0.531		
Colombia	Caqueta	0.412		
Colombia	Vichada	0.380		
Colombia	La Guajira	0.372		
Colombia	San Andres y Providencia	0.350		
Colombia	Vaupes	0.169		
Colombia	Guainia	0.093		
The Gambia	Gambia (country level)	0.591	20-11-10 - 21-1-10	21-3-10
Malawi	Malawi (country level)	0.831	20-11-10 - 21-1-10	21-3-10
Mozambique	Mozambique (country	0.680	20-11-10 - 21-1-10	21-3-10
	level)			
India	Kerala	0.521	20-11-15 – 21-1-15	21-3-15
India	Nagaland	0.293		
India	Meghalaya	0.262		
India	Jharkhand	0.260		
India	Maharashtra	0.253		

IndiaPuducherry0.216IndiaIndiaBihar0.187IndiaIndiaOdisha0.168IndiaIndiaRajasthan0.151IndiaIndiaGoa0.148IndiaIndiaSikkim0.100IndiaIndiaGujarat0.102IndiaIndiaChandigarh0.099IndiaIndiaChandigarh0.069IndiaIndiaDadra and Nagar Haveli0.067IndiaIndiaDadra and Nagar Haveli0.067IndiaIndiaJammu and Kashmir0.067IndiaIndiaMadhya Pradesh0.033IndiaIndiaMadhya Pradesh0.032IndiaIndiaHimachal Pradesh0.028IndiaIndiaKarnataka0.017IndiaIndiaKarnataka0.016IndiaIndiaAndaman and Nicobar0.000IndiaIndiaTripura0.008IndiaIndiaWest Bengal0.001IndiaIndiaHaryana0.001IndiaIndiaAndhra Pradesh0.000IndiaIndiaKarnataka0.016IndiaIndiaAndaman and Nicobar0.001IndiaIndiaAndaman and Nicobar0.001IndiaIndiaMathra Pradesh0.000IndiaIndiaMathra Pradesh0.000IndiaIndiaMathra Pradesh0.000IndiaIndia	India	Uttarakhand	0.252		
IndiaBihar0.187IndiaOdisha0.168IndiaRajasthan0.151IndiaGoa0.148IndiaSikkim0.100IndiaMizoram0.105IndiaGujarat0.102IndiaChandigarh0.099IndiaChandigarh0.069IndiaDadra and Nagar Haveli0.067IndiaJammu and Kashmir0.067IndiaMadhya Pradesh0.044IndiaMadhya Pradesh0.032IndiaHimachal Pradesh0.032IndiaKarnataka0.017IndiaKarnataka0.010IndiaLadakh0.016IndiaMadhya Pradesh0.004IndiaTelangana0.028IndiaMarnatka0.017IndiaKarnataka0.017IndiaKarnataka0.010IndiaTripura0.008IndiaMarnyana0.001IndiaHaryana0.001IndiaAndman and Nicobar0.010IndiaTripura0.000IndiaAndra Pradesh0.000IndiaAndra Pradesh0.001IndiaAndra Pradesh0.001IndiaAndra Pradesh0.001IndiaAndra Pradesh0.000IndiaAndra Pradesh0.000IndiaNorther Ireland0.606OptinicoJalisco0.841Verstor0.53320-11-10-21-10 </td <td>India</td> <td>Puducherry</td> <td>0.216</td> <td></td> <td></td>	India	Puducherry	0.216		
India Odisha 0.168 India India Rajasthan 0.151 India India Goa 0.148 India India Sikkim 0.105 India India Gujarat 0.102 India India Chandigarh 0.099 India India Chhattisgarh 0.086 India India Dadra and Nagar Haveli 0.069 India India Dadra and Nagar Haveli 0.067 India India Punjab 0.054 India India India Madhya Pradesh 0.044 India India India Machya Pradesh 0.028 India India India Telangana 0.029 India India India India Karnataka 0.017 India	India	Bihar	0.187		
IndiaRajasthan0.151IndiaIndiaGoa0.148IndiaIndiaMizoram0.108IndiaIndiaMizoram0.105IndiaIndiaGujarat0.102IndiaIndiaChandigarh0.099IndiaIndiaChhattisgarh0.066IndiaIndiaDadra and Nagar Haveli0.067IndiaIndiaDadra and Nagar Haveli0.067IndiaIndiaJammu and Kashmir0.067IndiaIndiaPunjab0.054IndiaIndiaMadhya Pradesh0.033IndiaIndiaHimachal Pradesh0.032IndiaIndiaHimachal Pradesh0.028IndiaIndiaKarnataka0.017IndiaIndiaLadakh0.016IndiaIndiaLadakh0.016IndiaIndiaTripura0.008IndiaIndiaTamil Nadu0.002IndiaIndiaHaryana0.001IndiaIndiaMathra Pradesh0.000IndiaIndiaMathra Pradesh0.000IndiaIndiaNCT of Delhi0.000IndiaIndiaAndhra Pradesh0.000IndiaIndiaAndhra Pradesh0.000IndiaIndiaNorth Vest0.603IndiaIndiaNorthern Ireland0.603IndiaUnitedNorth West0.598IndiaUnitedSouth Kast <t< td=""><td>India</td><td>Odisha</td><td>0.168</td><td></td><td></td></t<>	India	Odisha	0.168		
IndiaGoa0.148IndiaIndiaSikkim0.108IndiaIndiaMizoram0.105IndiaIndiaChandigarh0.102IndiaIndiaChandigarh0.099IndiaIndiaDadra and Nagar Haveli0.069IndiaIndiaDadra and Nagar Haveli0.067IndiaIndiaDadra and Nagar Haveli0.067IndiaIndiaPunjab0.054IndiaIndiaMadhya Pradesh0.044IndiaIndiaHimachal Pradesh0.032IndiaIndiaHimachal Pradesh0.028IndiaIndiaTelangana0.029IndiaIndiaKarnataka0.017IndiaIndiaAndaman and Nicobar0.010IndiaIndiaTamil Nadu0.004IndiaIndiaTamil Nadu0.002IndiaIndiaHaryana0.001IndiaIndiaMarkapana0.001IndiaIndiaAndma Pradesh0.000IndiaIndiaAndhra Pradesh0.000IndiaIndiaAndhra Pradesh0.000IndiaIndiaAndhra Pradesh0.000IndiaIndiaAndhra Pradesh0.000IndiaIndiaAndhra Pradesh0.000IndiaIndiaAndhra Pradesh0.000IndiaIndiaAndhra Pradesh0.000IndiaIndiaAndhra Pradesh0.000India <t< td=""><td>India</td><td>Rajasthan</td><td>0.151</td><td></td><td></td></t<>	India	Rajasthan	0.151		
IndiaSikkim0.108IndiaMizoram0.105IndiaGujarat0.102IndiaChandigarh0.099IndiaChhattisgarh0.066IndiaDadra and Nagar Haveli0.067IndiaJammu and Kashmir0.067IndiaPunjab0.054IndiaMadhya Pradesh0.044IndiaMadhya Pradesh0.033IndiaHimachal Pradesh0.029IndiaTelangana0.029IndiaKarnataka0.017IndiaLadakh0.016IndiaTripura0.008IndiaTripura0.008IndiaTamil Nadu0.004IndiaTamil Nadu0.001IndiaHaryana0.001IndiaMaripur0.028IndiaTamil Nadu0.004IndiaTamil Nadu0.004IndiaMaryana0.001IndiaMaryana0.001IndiaAndhra Pradesh0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.53320-11-10 - 21-1-1021-3-10MexicoMexico City0.339PakistanSindh0.533UnitedNorthern Ireland0.606UnitedSouth West0.598KingdomUnitedSouth KestUnitedSouth Kest	India	Goa	0.148		
IndiaMizoram0.105IndiaGujarat0.102IndiaChandigarh0.099IndiaChhattisgarh0.069IndiaDadra and Nagar Haveli0.069IndiaJammu and Kashmir0.054IndiaPunjab0.054IndiaMadhya Pradesh0.044IndiaAssam0.033IndiaHimachal Pradesh0.029IndiaTelangana0.029IndiaKarnataka0.017IndiaLadakh0.016IndiaAndaman and Nicobar0.008IndiaTripura0.008IndiaTamil Nadu0.004IndiaHaryana0.001IndiaMaripur0.228IndiaAndaman and Nicobar0.010IndiaTripura0.008IndiaTamil Nadu0.004IndiaHaryana0.001IndiaMaripare0.000IndiaNCT of Delhi0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaNorthern Ireland0.66620-11-10 - 21-1-1021-3-10UnitedNorth West0.603KingdomUnitedSouth Kest0.598KingdomUnitedSouth Kest0.597	India	Sikkim	0.108		
IndiaGujarat0.102IndiaChandigarh0.099IndiaChhattisgarh0.086IndiaDadra and Nagar Haveli0.069IndiaJammu and Kashmir0.067IndiaPunjab0.054IndiaMadhya Pradesh0.033IndiaHimachal Pradesh0.032IndiaTelangana0.029IndiaKarnataka0.017IndiaLadakh0.016IndiaAranataka0.017IndiaAndaman and Nicobar0.008IndiaTripura0.008IndiaTripura0.004IndiaTamil Nadu0.001IndiaMartyana0.001IndiaMartyana0.001IndiaMartyana0.001IndiaAndara and Nicobar0.001IndiaTamil Nadu0.002IndiaTamil Nadu0.001IndiaMartyana0.001IndiaMartyana0.001IndiaAndhra Pradesh0.000IndiaNCT of Delhi0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaNorthern Ireland0.606 Mexico Mexico City0.533 20-11-10 - 21-1-1021-3-10United North West0.603KingdomUnitedSouth KestKingdom0.598United	India	Mizoram	0.105		
IndiaChandigarh0.099IndiaChhattisgarh0.086IndiaDadra and Nagar Haveli0.069IndiaJammu and Kashmir0.067IndiaJammu and Kashmir0.067IndiaPunjab0.054IndiaMadhya Pradesh0.044IndiaAssam0.033IndiaHimachal Pradesh0.032IndiaTelangana0.029IndiaManipur0.028IndiaKarnataka0.017IndiaLadakh0.016IndiaTripura0.008IndiaTripura0.008IndiaTamil Nadu0.004IndiaHaryana0.001IndiaMarka Pradesh0.001IndiaTripura0.008IndiaTripura0.008IndiaMaryana0.001IndiaMarka Pradesh0.000IndiaNCT of Delhi0.000IndiaNCT of Delhi0.000MexicoMexico City0.369PakistanSindh0.533UnitedNorthern Ireland0.603KingdomInitedSouth West0.603UnitedSouth West0.598InitedKingdomInitedSouth Kast0.598	India	Gujarat	0.102		
IndiaChhattisgarh0.086IndiaDadra and Nagar Haveli0.069IndiaJammu and Kashmir0.067IndiaPunjab0.054IndiaPunjab0.054IndiaMadhya Pradesh0.044IndiaAssam0.033IndiaHimachal Pradesh0.032IndiaTelangana0.029IndiaTelangana0.029IndiaManipur0.028IndiaKarnataka0.017IndiaLadakh0.016IndiaTripura0.008IndiaTripura0.004IndiaTamil Nadu0.004IndiaHaryana0.001IndiaMart Pradesh0.001IndiaMart Pradesh0.001IndiaAndhra Pradesh0.000IndiaAndhra Pradesh0.000IndiaNCT of Delhi0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaAndhra Pradesh0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaNorthern Ireland0.60620-11-10 - 21-1:1021-3:10UnitedNorth West0.603Kingdom	India	Chandigarh	0.099		
IndiaDadra and Nagar Haveli0.069IndiaJammu and Kashmir0.067IndiaPunjab0.054IndiaMadhya Pradesh0.044IndiaAssam0.033IndiaHimachal Pradesh0.032IndiaTelangana0.029IndiaManipur0.028IndiaKarnataka0.017IndiaLadakh0.016IndiaAndaman and Nicobar0.000IndiaTripura0.008IndiaTamil Nadu0.004IndiaTamil Nadu0.001IndiaHaryana0.001IndiaMaripara0.001IndiaMaripara0.001IndiaTamil Nadu0.004IndiaMarka Pradesh0.000IndiaMarka Pradesh0.000IndiaNCT of Delhi0.000IndiaAndhra Pradesh0.000IndiaAnchra Pradesh0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaNorthern Ireland0.603VericoMexico City0.369PakistanSindh0.533UnitedNorthern Ireland0.603Kingdom	India	Chhattisgarh	0.086		
IndiaJammu and Kashmir0.067IndiaPunjab0.054IndiaMadhya Pradesh0.044IndiaAssam0.033IndiaHimachal Pradesh0.032IndiaTelangana0.029IndiaTelangana0.029IndiaManipur0.028IndiaKarnataka0.017IndiaLadakh0.016IndiaAndaman and Nicobar0.010IndiaTripura0.008IndiaTripura0.004IndiaTamil Nadu0.001IndiaWest Bengal0.001IndiaMatryana0.001IndiaAndhra Pradesh0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaNorthern Ireland0.60620-11-10 - 21-1-1021-3-10UnitedNorth West0.603KingdomUnitedSouth WestUnitedSouth West0.598KingdomNorth East0.597	India	Dadra and Nagar Haveli	0.069		
IndiaPunjab0.054IndiaMadhya Pradesh0.044IndiaAssam0.033IndiaHimachal Pradesh0.032IndiaTelangana0.029IndiaManipur0.028IndiaKarnataka0.017IndiaLadakh0.016IndiaAndaman and Nicobar0.000IndiaTripura0.008IndiaTamil Nadu0.004IndiaWest Bengal0.001IndiaUttar Pradesh0.001IndiaNCT of Delhi0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaNorthern Ireland0.66620-11-1021-3-10UnitedNorth West0.603KingdomCast Midlands0.598UnitedSouth West0.597KingdomSouth East0.597	India	Jammu and Kashmir	0.067		
IndiaMadhya Pradesh0.044IndiaAssam0.033IndiaHimachal Pradesh0.032IndiaTelangana0.029IndiaManipur0.028IndiaKarnataka0.017IndiaLadakh0.016IndiaAndaman and Nicobar0.010IndiaTripura0.008IndiaTamil Nadu0.004IndiaTamil Nadu0.001IndiaHaryana0.001IndiaUttar Pradesh0.001IndiaNCT of Delhi0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaSindh0.53320-11-10 - 21-1-10Z1-3-10UnitedNorthern Ireland0.603KingdomUnitedSouth West0.598UnitedSouth West0.598UnitedKingdomSouth East0.597Image State Sta	India	Punjab	0.054		
IndiaAssam0.033IndiaHimachal Pradesh0.032IndiaTelangana0.029IndiaManipur0.028IndiaKarnataka0.017IndiaLadakh0.016IndiaAndaman and Nicobar0.010IndiaTripura0.008IndiaTamil Nadu0.004IndiaWest Bengal0.001IndiaHaryana0.001IndiaUttar Pradesh0.001IndiaNCT of Delhi0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaSindh0.53320-11-10 - 21-11021-3-10UnitedNorthern Ireland0.603KingdomUnitedSouth West0.598-KingdomUnitedSouth Kast0.597-	India	Madhya Pradesh	0.044		
IndiaHimachal Pradesh0.032IndiaTelangana0.029IndiaManipur0.028IndiaManipur0.028IndiaKarnataka0.017IndiaLadakh0.016IndiaAndaman and Nicobar0.010IndiaTripura0.008IndiaTamil Nadu0.004IndiaTamil Nadu0.001IndiaWest Bengal0.002IndiaHaryana0.001IndiaMtra Pradesh0.000IndiaAndhra Pradesh0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaMexico City0.369PakistanSindh0.53320-11-10 - 21-1-10UnitedNorthern Ireland0.60620-11-15 - 21-1-15KingdomCital Andhras0.598UnitedSouth West0.598KingdomCital Andhras0.598	India	Assam	0.033		
IndiaTelangana0.029IndiaManipur0.028IndiaKarnataka0.017IndiaLadakh0.016IndiaAndaman and Nicobar0.010IndiaTripura0.008IndiaTamil Nadu0.004IndiaWest Bengal0.002IndiaHaryana0.001IndiaUttar Pradesh0.000IndiaNCT of Delhi0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaSindh0.53320-11-10 - 21-1-1021-3-10MexicoMexico City0.369PakistanSindh0.533UnitedNorth West0.603Kingdom	India	Himachal Pradesh	0.032		
IndiaManipur0.028IndiaKarnataka0.017IndiaLadakh0.016IndiaAndaman and Nicobar0.010IndiaTripura0.008IndiaTamil Nadu0.004IndiaTamil Nadu0.002IndiaWest Bengal0.002IndiaHaryana0.001IndiaUttar Pradesh0.001IndiaNCT of Delhi0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaArconchar Pradesh0.000IndiaNCT of Delhi0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaNorthern Ireland0.606UnitedNorth West0.603KingdomIndiaNorth WestUnitedSouth West0.598KingdomUnitedSouth KestUnitedSouth East0.597	India	Telangana	0.029		
IndiaKarnataka0.017IndiaLadakh0.016IndiaAndaman and Nicobar0.010IndiaTripura0.008IndiaTamil Nadu0.004IndiaTamil Nadu0.002IndiaWest Bengal0.002IndiaHaryana0.001IndiaUttar Pradesh0.000IndiaNCT of Delhi0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaNort of Delhi0.0369MexicoMexico City0.369PakistanSindh0.53320-11-10 - 21-1-10UnitedNorthern Ireland0.60620-11-15 - 21-1-15KingdomUnitedSouth West0.598.UnitedSouth West0.598.UnitedSouth Kest0.598.UnitedSouth Kest0.597.Kingdom	India	Manipur	0.028		
IndiaLadakh0.016IndiaAndaman and Nicobar0.010IndiaTripura0.008IndiaTamil Nadu0.004IndiaTamil Nadu0.002IndiaWest Bengal0.002IndiaHaryana0.001IndiaUttar Pradesh0.000IndiaAndhra Pradesh0.000IndiaNCT of Delhi0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaMexico0.84120-11-10 - 21-1-1021-3-10MexicoMexico City0.369PakistanSindh0.53320-11-10 - 21-1-10UnitedNorth West0.603Kingdom	India	Karnataka	0.017		
IndiaAndaman and Nicobar0.010IndiaTripura0.008IndiaTamil Nadu0.004IndiaTamil Nadu0.002IndiaWest Bengal0.002IndiaHaryana0.001IndiaUttar Pradesh0.000IndiaAndhra Pradesh0.000IndiaNCT of Delhi0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaMexicoJalisco0.84120-11-10 - 21-1-1021-3-10MexicoMexico City0.369PakistanSindh0.53320-11-10 - 21-1-10UnitedNorthern Ireland0.60620-11-15 - 21-1-15KingdomIndiaNorth West0.603UnitedSouth West0.598IndiaUnitedSouth West0.598IndiaUnitedSouth Kast0.597IndiaUnitedSouth East0.597India	India	Ladakh	0.016		
IndiaTripura0.008IndiaTamil Nadu0.004IndiaWest Bengal0.002IndiaHaryana0.001IndiaHaryana0.001IndiaUttar Pradesh0.000IndiaAndhra Pradesh0.000IndiaNCT of Delhi0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaMexicoJalisco0.84120-11-10 - 21-1-1021-3-10MexicoMexico City0.369PakistanSindh0.53320-11-10 - 21-1-10UnitedNorthern Ireland0.60620-11-15 - 21-1-15KingdomIntiedNorth West0.603UnitedSouth West0.598Intied intiesUnitedSouth West0.598IntiesUnitedSouth West0.597IntiesUnitedSouth East0.597Inties	India	Andaman and Nicobar	0.010		
IndiaTamil Nadu0.004IndiaWest Bengal0.002IndiaHaryana0.001IndiaUttar Pradesh0.001IndiaAndhra Pradesh0.000IndiaNCT of Delhi0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaMexico Gity0.369PakistanSindh0.53320-11-10 - 21-1-10UnitedNorthern Ireland0.60620-11-15 - 21-1-15KingdomConstant0.5981UnitedSouth West0.5981UnitedSouth West0.5981UnitedSouth Kest0.5971UnitedSouth East0.5971	India	Tripura	0.008		
IndiaWest Bengal0.002IndiaIndiaHaryana0.001IndiaIndiaUttar Pradesh0.001IndiaIndiaAndhra Pradesh0.000IndiaIndiaNCT of Delhi0.000IndiaIndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaIndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaMexicoJalisco0.84120-11-10 - 21-1-1021-3-10MexicoMexico City0.369IndiaPakistanSindh0.53320-11-10 - 21-1-1021-3-10UnitedNorthern Ireland0.60620-11-15 - 21-1-1521-3-15KingdomIndiaNorth West0.603IndiaUnitedSouth West0.598IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth West0.598IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth West0.598IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kast0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kast0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kast0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kast0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kast0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kast0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kast0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kast0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kast0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kast0.597 </td <td>India</td> <td>Tamil Nadu</td> <td>0.004</td> <td></td> <td></td>	India	Tamil Nadu	0.004		
IndiaHaryana0.001IndiaIndiaUttar Pradesh0.001IndiaIndiaAndhra Pradesh0.000IndiaIndiaNCT of Delhi0.000IndiaIndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaIndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaMexicoJalisco0.84120-11-10-21-1-1021-3-10MexicoMexico City0.369IndiaPakistanSindh0.53320-11-10-21-1-1021-3-10UnitedNorthern Ireland0.60620-11-15-21-1-1521-3-15KingdomIndia0.598IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth West0.598IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth West0.598IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth West0.598IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kest0.598IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kest0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth East0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth East0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth East0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth East0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth East0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth East0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth East0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth East0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth East0.59	India	West Bengal	0.002		
IndiaUttar Pradesh0.001IndiaIndiaAndhra Pradesh0.000IndiaIndiaNCT of Delhi0.000IndiaIndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaMexicoJalisco0.84120-11-10 - 21-1-1021-3-10MexicoMexico City0.369IndiaPakistanSindh0.53320-11-10 - 21-1-1021-3-10UnitedNorthern Ireland0.60620-11-15 - 21-1-1521-3-15KingdomIndiaNorth West0.603IndiaUnitedNorth West0.603IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth West0.598IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth West0.598IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kest0.598IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kest0.598IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kest0.598IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kest0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kest0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kest0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kest0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kest0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kest0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kest0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kest0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kest0.597IndiaIndiaU	India	Haryana	0.001		
IndiaAndhra Pradesh0.000IndiaIndiaNCT of Delhi0.000IndiaIndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000IndiaMexicoJalisco0.84120-11-10 - 21-1-1021-3-10MexicoMexico City0.369IndiaPakistanSindh0.53320-11-10 - 21-1-1021-3-10UnitedNorthern Ireland0.60620-11-15 - 21-1-1521-3-15KingdomIndiaNorth West0.603IndiaUnitedNorth West0.598IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth West0.598IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth West0.598IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kest0.598IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kest0.598IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kest0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth East0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kest0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kest0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kest0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kest0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kest0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kest0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth Kest0.597IndiaIndiaUnitedSouth KestIndiaIndiaIndiaUnitedSouth KestIndiaIndiaIndia </td <td>India</td> <td>Uttar Pradesh</td> <td>0.001</td> <td></td> <td></td>	India	Uttar Pradesh	0.001		
IndiaNCT of Delhi0.000IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000MexicoJalisco0.84120-11-10 - 21-1-1021-3-10MexicoMexico City0.36920-11-10 - 21-1-1021-3-10PakistanSindh0.53320-11-10 - 21-1-1021-3-10UnitedNorthern Ireland0.60620-11-15 - 21-1-1521-3-15KingdomImage: Comparison of the second seco	India	Andhra Pradesh	0.000		
IndiaArunachal Pradesh0.000MexicoJalisco0.84120-11-10 – 21-1-1021-3-10MexicoMexico City0.36920-11-10 – 21-1-1021-3-10PakistanSindh0.53320-11-10 – 21-1-1021-3-10UnitedNorthern Ireland0.60620-11-15 – 21-1-1521-3-15KingdomUnitedNorth West0.6031000000000000000000000000000000000000	India	NCT of Delhi	0.000		
Mexico Jalisco 0.841 20-11-10 - 21-1-10 21-3-10 Mexico Mexico City 0.369 21-3-10 21-3-10 21-3-10 21-3-10 21-3-10 21-3-10 21-3-10 21-3-10 21-3-10 21-3-10 21-3-10 21-3-10 21-3-10 21-3-10 21-3-15 21-3-	India	Arunachal Pradesh	0.000		
MexicoMexico City0.369Image: constraint of the systemPakistanSindh0.53320-11-10 - 21-1-1021-3-10UnitedNorthern Ireland0.60620-11-15 - 21-1-1521-3-15KingdomNorth West0.603Image: constraint of the systemImage: constraint of the systemUnitedNorth West0.603Image: constraint of the systemImage: constraint of the systemUnitedEast Midlands0.598Image: constraint of the systemImage: constraint of the systemUnitedSouth West0.598Image: constraint of the systemImage: constraint of the systemUnitedSouth West0.598Image: constraint of the systemImage: constraint of the systemUnitedSouth East0.597Image: constraint of the systemImage: constraint of the systemImage: constraint of the systemUnitedSouth East0.597Image: constraint of the systemImage: constraint of the systemImage: constraint of the systemUnitedSouth East0.597Image: constraint of the systemImage: constraint of the systemImage: constraint of the system	Mexico	Jalisco	0.841	20-11-10 - 21-1-10	21-3-10
PakistanSindh0.53320-11-10 - 21-1-1021-3-10United KingdomNorthern Ireland C0.60620-11-15 - 21-1-1521-3-15United KingdomNorth West0.603United KingdomNorth West0.603United KingdomEast Midlands0.598United KingdomSouth West0.598United KingdomSouth West0.598United KingdomSouth West0.598United KingdomSouth East0.597	Mexico	Mexico City	0.369		
United KingdomNorthern Ireland0.60620-11-15 - 21-1-1521-3-15United KingdomNorth West0.603United KingdomEast Midlands0.598United KingdomSouth West0.598United KingdomSouth West0.598United KingdomSouth West0.598United KingdomSouth East0.597	Pakistan	Sindh	0.533	20-11-10 - 21-1-10	21-3-10
KingdomNorth West0.603United KingdomEast Midlands0.598United KingdomSouth West0.598United KingdomSouth West0.598United KingdomSouth West0.598Kingdom	United	Northern Ireland	0.606	20-11-15 – 21-1-15	21-3-15
United KingdomNorth West0.603United KingdomEast Midlands0.598United United KingdomSouth West0.598United KingdomSouth West0.598United KingdomSouth East0.597	Kingdom				
KingdomConstraintUnited KingdomEast Midlands0.598United KingdomSouth West0.598United KingdomSouth East0.597KingdomKingdomKingdom	United	North West	0.603		
UnitedEast Midlands0.598Kingdom0.598UnitedSouth WestUnitedSouth EastUnitedSouth EastKingdom0.597	Kingdom				
Kingdom South West 0.598 United South East 0.597 Kingdom Kingdom Kingdom	United	East Midlands	0.598		
Kingdom 0.598 United South West 0.597 Kingdom	Kingdom	South Wast	0.500		
United South East 0.597 Kingdom	Kingdom	South west	0.598		
Kingdom	United	South Fast	0 597		
	Kingdom		0.557		

United	East of England	0.586	
Kingdom			
United	London	0.574	
Kingdom			
United	Scotland	0.548	
Kingdom			
United	Yorkshire	0.526	
Kingdom			
United	Wales	0.431	
Kingdom			
United	West Midlands	0.598	
Kingdom			
United	North East	0.526	
Kingdom			

Figures section 1: Spatial heterogeneity in G index.

Note the color scale is identical for all maps shown. See Table 2 for values by region, lookback period used in input data, and target trial dates. Note that for Pakistan (Sindh), Mexico (Jalisco, Mexico City) and The Gambia, values are given in Table 2.











Figures section 2: Historical Rt estimates

Regional estimates of Rt for Brazil, Colombia, the United Kingdom and India available at <u>Epiforecasts.io.</u>

Buenos Aires Province (Argentina):



Estimated Rt values for Buenos Aires Province showing 50% and 90% credible intervals.

Mexico City (Mexico):



Estimated Rt values for Mexico City showing 50% and 0% credible intervals.

Sindh Province (Pakistan):



Estimated Rt values for Sindh province showing 50% and 90% credible intervals.

The Gambia:



Estimated Rt values for The Gambia showing 50% and 90% credible intervals.

Malawi



Estimated Rt values for Malawi showing 50% and 90% credible intervals (G = 0.84).

Mozambique:



Estimated Rt values for Malawi showing 50% and 90% credible intervals (G = 0.68).

References:

16

^{1.} Abbott, S. et al. Estimating the time-varying reproduction number of SARS-CoV-2 using national

and subnational case counts. Wellcome Open Res. 5, 112 (2020).

- Google-research/open-covid-19-data: Open source aggregation pipeline for public COVID-19 data, including hospitalization/ICU/ventilator numbers for many countries. https://github.com/google-research/open-covid-19-data.
- 3. Epiforecasts/covid-rt-estimates: National and subnational estimates of the time-varying reproduction number for Covid-19. https://github.com/epiforecasts/covid-rt-estimates.
- 4. IHME, COVID-19. https://covid19.healthdata.org/global?view=total-deaths&tab=trend.
- 5. Thompson, R. N. *et al.* Improved inference of time-varying reproduction numbers during infectious disease outbreaks. *Epidemics* **29**, 100356 (2019).
- 6. EpiNow2. https://cran.r-project.org/web/packages/EpiNow2/EpiNow2.pdf.
- 7. Stan Stan. https://mc-stan.org/.
- 8. Ganyani, T. *et al.* Estimating the generation interval for coronavirus disease (COVID-19) based on symptom onset data, March 2020. *Eurosurveillance* **25**, (2020).
- 9. Lauer, S. A. *et al.* The incubation period of coronavirus disease 2019 (CoVID-19) from publicly reported confirmed cases: Estimation and application. *Ann. Intern. Med.* **172**, 577–582 (2020).
- Covid-projections/covid-projections: Code powering Covid Act Now A site urging Public leaders
 & health officials to take action now to prevent the spread of COVID-19.
 https://github.com/covid-projections/covid-projections.